

WESLEY
AND
METHODIST
STUDIES



THE
PENNSYLVANIA
STATE
UNIVERSITY
PRESS

VOL. 16, NO. 1

2024

WESLEY AND METHODIST STUDIES

VOL. 16, NO. 1, 2024

ARTICLES

*Singing of the Spirit: Wesleyan Hymnody, Methodist
Pneumatology, and World Christianity* / 1

J. KWABENA ASAMOAH-GYADU

*Wesley and the People Called Papists: Recusancy, Methodism,
and Religious Tension in Eighteenth-Century Britain* / 29

GREGORY JAMES TIRENIN

*The Women's Ordination Movement in the United States:
A Literature Review* / 59

NANCY ROSS

*Holiness and Pentecostal Missions in El Salvador:
The Example of Frederick Ernest Mebius* / 83

ROBERT A. DANIELSON

BOOK REVIEWS

John R. Tyson, *Born in Crisis and Shaped by Controversy. The Relevant
History of Methodism, Volume 1: Born in Crisis* / 106

REVIEWED BY JONATHAN DEAN

Simon Lewis, *Anti-Methodism and Theological Controversy
in Eighteenth-Century England: The Struggle for True Religion* / 107

REVIEWED BY G. M. DITCHFIELD

Paul W. Chilcote, *The Quest for Love Divine: Select Essays
in Wesleyan Theology and Practice* / 109

REVIEWED BY MARTIN WELLINGS

Jean-Pierre Bastian, Christian Grosse, and Sarah Scholl (eds), *Les fractures protestantes en Suisse romande au XIXe siècle* / 111

REVIEWED BY DAVID BUNDY

Clive Murray Norris, *A History of Methodist Insurance in Britain* / 113

REVIEWED BY DAVID J. JEREMY

Joerg Rieger and Upolu Lumā Vaai (eds), *Methodist Revolutions: Evangelical Engagements of Church and World* / 114

REVIEWED BY JOSIAH U. YOUNG III

SHORT NOTICES

Daniel Reed (ed.), *Methodism and Monasticism* / 117

REVIEWED BY MARTIN WELLINGS

Clive D. Field (ed.), *Methodism in Great Britain and Ireland: A Select Bibliography of Published Local Histories* / 118

REVIEWED BY TIM WOOLLEY

P. S. Barnwell and Mark Smith (eds), *Places of Worship in Britain and Ireland, 1829–1929* / 119

REVIEWED BY MARTIN WELLINGS

**THE MANCHESTER WESLEY RESEARCH CENTRE
AND THE OXFORD CENTRE FOR METHODISM
AND CHURCH HISTORY / 120**

Wesley and Methodist Studies (WMS) publishes peer-reviewed scholarly articles that examine the life and work of John and Charles Wesley, their contemporaries in the eighteenth-century Evangelical Revival, their historical and theological antecedents, their successors in the Wesleyan and Evangelical traditions, and studies of these traditions today. We conceive of Methodist, Wesleyan, and Evangelical studies broadly and publish articles on these traditions from any academic discipline and from multidisciplinary perspectives. WMS is a collaborative project of the Manchester Wesley Research Centre and the Oxford Centre for Methodism and Church History, Oxford Brookes University, and is published biannually by Penn State University Press. WMS Website: www.mwrc.ac.uk/wesley-and-methodist-studies.

SUBMISSION INFORMATION

All submissions should be sent to the editors using the journal's online submission and peer review system: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/wms/>. Detailed guidelines for submission are available for download from the menu in Editorial Manager.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION

Wesley and Methodist Studies is published biannually by the Penn State University Press, 820 N. University Dr., USB 1-C, University Park, PA 16802. Subscriptions, claims, and changes of address should be directed to our subscription agent, the Johns Hopkins University Press, P.O. Box 19966, Baltimore, MD 21211, phone 1-800-548-1784 (outside USA and Canada: 410-516-6987), jrnlcirc@jh.edu. Subscribers are requested to notify the Press and their local postmaster immediately of change of address. All correspondence of a business nature, including permissions and advertising, should be addressed to Penn State University Press, journals@psu.edu.

The Penn State University Press is a member of the Association of University Presses. This journal is indexed in the ATLA Religion Database® (ATLA RDB®), a product of the American Theological Library Association, 300 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 2100, Chicago, IL 60606, USA. Email: atla@atla.com, www: <http://www.atla.com>; in Scopus, the largest abstract and citation database of peer-reviewed literature (<https://www.elsevier.com/solutions/scopus>); and in the European Reference Index for the Humanities and Social Sciences (ERIH).

RIGHTS AND PERMISSION

The journal is registered under its ISSN (2291-1723 [E-ISSN 2291-1731]) with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923 (www.copyright.com). For information about reprints or multiple copying for classroom use, contact the CCC's Academic Permissions Service, or write to the Pennsylvania State University Press, 820 N. University Dr., USB 1-C, University Park, PA 16802.

Cover: Manuscript page of Charles Wesley's sermon 'Remembering the Sabbath' reproduced courtesy of The University of Manchester and the Trustees for Methodist Church Purposes.

Copyright © 2024 by the Manchester Wesley Research Centre and the Oxford Centre for Methodism and Church History. All rights reserved. No copies may be made without the written permission of the publisher.

SINGING OF THE SPIRIT

Wesleyan Hymnody, Methodist Pneumatology, and World Christianity

J. KWABENA ASAMOAH-GYADU



ABSTRACT

'Methodism was born in song', so says the opening sentence of the preface to the 1933 edition of the *Methodist Hymn Book*. That edition, inherited from the Wesleyan Missionary Society from the early nineteenth century, is still in use in many Methodist Churches of British descent in Africa. Using the West African country of Ghana as a case study, this article reflects on select 'hymns of the Holy Spirit' in the hymn book. Through these hymns of the Spirit, we capture some of the main theological underpinnings of Wesleyan pneumatology as understood within an African context in which Methodism remains a formidable denomination. The influence of Methodism on Christianity in Africa has been through its hymn-singing culture. The Wesleyan theology of the Holy Spirit as the source of regeneration, sanctification, and empowerment is evident in the pneumatological hymns in the collection.

Keywords: John Wesley, Charles Wesley, hymns, Holy Spirit, oral theology, Africa, Methodism

Alan M. Guenther observed that the early globalization of Wesleyan Methodism cannot be explained apart from its hymnody.¹ In this article, we reflect on the

A version of this article was presented as the eighteenth Manchester Wesley Research Centre Annual Lecture in June 2022. The video recording of the lecture is available at: https://youtu.be/xf4_KFU3RQs.

1. Alan M. Guenther, 'The Globalization of Methodist Hymnody', *Wesley and Methodist Studies*, 14/2 (2022), 117–45.

WESLEY AND THE PEOPLE CALLED PAPISTS

*Recusancy, Methodism, and Religious Tension in
Eighteenth-Century Britain*

GREGORY JAMES TIRENIN



ABSTRACT

Scholarly interest in Wesley's views of Catholicism and his conceptions of catholicity has increased significantly. This article examines how British Catholics, especially Bishop Richard Challoner of London and Fr Arthur O'Leary of Cork, engaged with Methodism in late Georgian Britain. Despite the proscribed status of the Catholic Church during this period, Catholics participated to an impressive degree in the controversies surrounding Methodism by defining themselves against Wesley both theologically and politically. Their actions aroused considerable interest and controversy, thus demonstrating the vitality of the Catholic community in an age when the Anglican confessional state was under considerable pressure.

Keywords: John Wesley, Richard Challoner, Arthur O'Leary, Catholicism, toleration

The minutes of the Methodist Conference at London on 7 August 1770, greatly unnerved Sir Richard Hill, second baronet, and long-time member of the Methodist movement. Since his time at Oxford, where he felt his own heart 'strangely warmed' on 18 February 1758, Hill publicly supported and encouraged the Calvinistic wing of the Methodist movement, while continuing his adherence to the Church of England.¹ To Hill, as well as Countess Huntington

Grateful thanks are due to Prof. Christopher Evans of Boston University for his feedback on drafts of this article and to the anonymous readers of *Wesley and Methodist Studies*.

1. W. C. Sydney and S. J. Skedd, 'Hill, Sir Richard, Second Baronet (1733–1808), Religious Controversialist', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*.

THE WOMEN'S ORDINATION MOVEMENT IN THE UNITED STATES

A Literature Review

NANCY ROSS



ABSTRACT

This literature review examines the scholarship on women's ordination across several Christian traditions in the United States from an intersectional feminist perspective. It comments on the problems of centring patriarchal church institutions in these histories, the lack of feminist analysis, and the problem of 'firsts.' It also includes a case study on women's ordination in the Methodist movement to demonstrate the erasure of women's networks and advocacy and the advocacy-and-rejection cycle that women experienced in several denominations. Finally, there is a discussion of women in churches that do not ordain them and reflections on further directions for scholarly study.

Keywords: women's ordination, intersectionality, case study, feminism, Methodism

In recent decades, scholars of gender and religion have paid close attention to the institutional processes and impact of women's ordination on Christian churches in the United States. There are many moments to memorialize, and much of the literature celebrates the institutional changes that legitimized women's ordination in Protestant traditions. However, these structural changes have come with costs borne by ordained women and their advocates, and many women called to ordained ministry still lack the opportunity within their denominations. Women in these traditions continue to advocate for women's ordination. For churches that have ordained women, many congregations have resisted and continue to resist women's ordained ministry. The history of women's ordination is thus not a settled issue of the past that reflects a joyful story of prohibition-turned-acceptance,

HOLINESS AND PENTECOSTAL MISSIONS IN EL SALVADOR

The Example of Frederick Ernest Mebius

ROBERT A. DANIELSON



ABSTRACT

Frederick Mebius is credited as the first Pentecostal missionary to El Salvador, but his story is more complicated. As a missionary for the Christian and Missionary Alliance in Bolivia, Mebius was a part of the Holiness Movement. Tracing his history reveals a gap of information from 1903 to 1908, from Los Angeles, California, to El Paso, Texas. In the interim, oral history places Mebius as founding churches around 1904 in El Salvador. This history creates space to explore Holiness missions that emerged from Los Angeles and speculate about how Mebius might have arrived in El Salvador first as a Holiness evangelist before his return as a Pentecostal.

Keywords: El Salvador, Frederick Ernest Mebius, Pentecostalism, Holiness Movement, mission history

Scholars researching church history in El Salvador often encounter a statement such as: 'Frederick Mebius, an early Canadian Pentecostal missionary arrived in El Salvador in 1904.' Anyone steeped in the history of Holiness and early Pentecostal missions should immediately raise questions. Since most Pentecostal historians chart the beginning of the Pentecostal Movement to the 1906 Azusa Revival in Los Angeles, how can this be true? For scholars of Holiness missions, the story of such a missionary could shed light on the interaction between Holiness missions and their role in the development of subsequent Pentecostal mission work.

THE MANCHESTER WESLEY RESEARCH CENTRE
AND THE OXFORD CENTRE FOR METHODISM
AND CHURCH HISTORY

The Manchester Wesley Research Centre (MWRC)

The MWRC supports the research of scholars studying the Methodist, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Holiness, and Pentecostal traditions, particularly from MWRC partner institutions. Each year visiting research fellows are welcomed for short periods of intensive research in Manchester. The MWRC helps facilitate access to the world-renowned Methodist Archives and Research Centre at The John Rylands Research Institute and Library in Manchester. It also has its own specialist library with research space for visiting researchers and PhD students studying at MWRC partner institutions. The Centre regularly hosts lectures and conferences, normally available simultaneously in person and online. It is also involved in the publication of the book series *Studies in the Holiness and Pentecostal Movements*. For more information about the Centre and upcoming events, go to: www.mwrc.ac.uk or contact the Centre's Director, Dr Geordan Hammond: ghammond@nazarene.ac.uk.

The Oxford Centre for Methodism and Church History

The Oxford Centre for Methodism and Church History is a research centre of Oxford Brookes University, which embodies the relationship between the university and the trustees of the former Westminster College, Oxford. The Centre is home to important resources, including the Wesley Historical Society Library and a number of archive and art collections. The Routledge *Methodist Studies* series of monograph research publications is also edited from the Centre. The Centre offers a small number of visiting research fellowships each year to enable scholars to come to Oxford to use its resources. The Centre also has a number of research students working in the broad field of religious history and culture. It also sponsors lectures, conferences,

and other research activity. For more information, go to: <https://www.brookes.ac.uk/research/units/hss/centres/ocmch/> or contact the Centre's Director, Professor William Gibson: wgibson@brookes.ac.uk.

Methodist Studies Seminars

The Oxford Centre for Methodism and Church History, Oxford Brookes University, and the Manchester Wesley Research Centre have worked in partnership for a number of years. In 2012, the centres established a biannual seminar series that has now extended to include the Wesley Study Centre, St John's College, Durham University; Wesley House, Cambridge; Cliff College; and The Queen's Foundation, Birmingham. The seminars provide an opportunity for established and emerging scholars of Methodist Studies to present the findings of their research. We conceive of Methodist Studies broadly and aim to provide opportunities for students of history, theology, literature, art, material culture, and other fields related to Methodism. For further information, visit: www.mwrc.ac.uk/methodist-studies-seminars/.